

MPAs to help save Scottish seas: the NGO perspective



Calum Duncan, Head of Conservation Scotland Marine Conservation Society



Overview

- Scotland's seas in context
- □ What MPAs are for
- □ Why we supported June 2015 proposals
- □ Remaining concerns post Dec 2015
- □ Next Steps



UK in a global context

Benjamin S. Halpern, *et al* (2008). A Global Map of Human Impact on Marine Ecosystems Science 319, 948



Very Low Impact (<1.4)
 Medium Impact (4.95–8.47)
 High Impact (12–15.52)
 Low Impact (1.4–4.95)
 Medium High Impact (8.47–12)
 Very High Impact (>15.52)





North Sea





Japanese Waters

Torres Straight



OSPAR Quality Status Report 2010



"OSPAR's actions are clearly helping to reduce pollution of the marine environment, but many problems persist. The most widespread impacts on ecosystems result from fishing, and the emerging impacts of climate change cause serious concern."

Many **Th/D spp/habitats** Pressure expected to **increase**



Charting Progress 2 (2010)



"Many seabed sedimentary habitats in large areas of the North Sea, the Western Channel and Celtic Sea, and the Irish Sea have been adversely affected, particularly by mobile fishing gears."



Scotland's Marine Atlas (2011)







The habitats picture made plain

"There are two significant pressures on the Scottish marine area which are widespread:

 Human activity contributing to climate change

• **Fishing**, which impacts on the seabed and species"



Blue = Least Damaged/Most Natural





Map projected in Europe Albers Equal Area Conic (Modified Standard Parallels - Standard Parallel 1 = 50.2; Standard Parallel 2 = 58.5). The exact limits of the UK Continental Shelf are set out in orders made under section 1(7) of the Continental Shelf Act 1964

24 July 2014 - 30 new Scottish MPAs



NOT FOR NAVIGATION. Created by Scottish Government (Marine Scotland) 2014. gj07800 . Crown copyright and database rights (2014) Ordnance Survey licence 100024655. Made with Natural Earth. Projection: Europe Albers Equal Area Conic. Datum: WGS1984. Scale 1:6,500,000 .







Scotland's MPA Network





Scottish sea area = 61% UK seas





Living within Environmental Limits

Living Within

Environmental Limits Respecting the limits of the planet's environment, resources and biodiversity to improve our environment and ensure that the natural resources needed for life are unimpaired and remain so for future generations.



Ensuring a Strong, Healthy & Just Society Meeting the diverse needs of all people in existing and

future communities, promoting personal wellbeing, social cohesion and inclusion, and creating equal opportunity for all.

Achieving a Sustainable Economy

Economy Building a strong, stable and sustainable economy which provides prosperity and opportunities for all, and in which environmental and social costs fall on those who impose them (Polluter Pays), and efficient resource use is incentivised.

Using Sound Science Responsibly Ensuring policy is developed and implemented on the basis of strong scientific evidence, whilst taking into account scientific uncertainty (through the Precautionary Principle) as well as public attitudes and

values.

Promoting Good Governance

Actively promoting effective, participative systems of governance in all levels of society engaging people's creativity, energy, and diversity.



Overview

- Scotland's seas in context
- □ What MPAs are for
- □ Why we supported June 2015 proposals
- □ Remaining concerns post Dec 2015
- □ Thoughts and next Steps



Marine (Scotland) Act 2010

Duties on Scottish Ministers to:

- Protect and enhance health of Scottish seas
- Establish a National Marine Plan
- Deliver a network of Marine Protected Areas

OSPAR convention

World Summit on Sustainable Development (2012)

EU Marine Strategy Framework Directive



What MPAs are for...

Protecting & recovering marine biodiversity

Supporting and enhancing ecosystem goods and services e.g. seafood productivity, climate regulation, nutrient cycling, aggregates & recreation

□ Boosting *recovery* in the health of our seas



...as part of a three-pillar approach to conservation







SITES ncMPAs e.g. South Arran SACs e.g. East Mingulay SPAs SSSIs

SPECIES WCA / NC(S)A EU Birds/Habitats OSPAR/IUCN WIDER SEAS Marine Planning Fishery regulation Licensing



Recovery!

- □ Recover spatial *extent* of a habitat
- □ Recover *biodiversity* of a habitat
- □ Recover ecosystem function of a habitat
- □ Recover *population number* of species



Recovery in extent – Lyme Bay SAC















Supporting ecosystem services

"Recovery of marine biodiversity increases productivity fourfold...We conclude that marine biodiversity loss is increasingly impairing the ocean's capacity to provide food, maintain water quality, and recover from perturbations. Yet available data suggest that at this point, these trends are still reversible."

Worm *et al* (2006), 'Impacts of Biodiversity Loss on Ocean Ecosystem Services, Science, Vol 314



Scotland's first No-Take Zone est. Oct 2008









"...ecological communities within Lamlash Bay are *more diverse and more abundant within the NTZ than outside*, and that scallop populations within the NTZ are made up of older, larger and a greater number of individuals." Leigh Howarth



2003-2014 Seasearch diving











Temperate hpMPAs are more productive



Average changes in fishes, invertebrates, and seaweeds within marine reserves from temperate (blue bars) and tropical (orange bars) regions around the world. Although changes varied among reserves (black dots), most reserves had positive changes in both regions. *Data*: *Ref.* 8

- Fishes, invertebrates, and seaweeds typically have grown 28% bigger and have become 166% more abundant inside marine reserves.
- On average, diversity has increased 21% and biomass has increased 446% inside marine reserves.
- Both temperate and tropical marine reserves have been effective.
- The bigger fishes and invertebrates in marine reserves can produce more young than smaller animals outside reserves.
- In existing marine reserves, many species increased, particularly those that were fished, and some species decreased, such as those that are prey to fished species.

www.piscoweb.org/topics/marine-protected-areas



...supporting spillover effects



The estimated average distances traveled by young invertebrates (51 species), fishes (26 species), and seaweeds (13 species) prior to settling at their adult homes. Distances are based on genetic analysis of species around the world. Data: Kinlan & Gaines (2003) Ecology



Maximum Distance Traveled from Marine Reserve (miles)

This graph shows the maximum distances that tagged fishes traveled from marine reserves in Kenya (violet), Alaska (navy), and Florida (turquoise). These studies provide direct evidence that fishes spill over from marine reserves into surrounding waters. Data: Kaunda-Arara & Rose (2004) Environmental Biology of Fishes; Johnson et al (1999) North American Journal of Fisheries Management; Starr et al. (2006) Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences



Isle of Man productivity increase





In eight years: 2.5 to 22 scallops/100m²





Lundy Island No-Take Zone

□ 6 x more lobsters inside NTZ

Spillover of juveniles onto fishing grounds?









Windsock Closure



FISHERIES RESEARCH SERVICES

SCOTTISH INDUSTRY / SCIENCE PARTNERSHIP (SISP) Report No 02/09

WEST OF FOUR -EFFECTIVENESS OF WINDSOCK AREA CLOSURE





- lesser spotted dogfish, as well as other elasmobranchs, increased markedly
- beneficial effects on large fish in the closed area (such as cod and large anglerfish)



- Scotland's seas in context
- □ What MPAs are for
- □ Why we supported June 2015 proposals
- □ Remaining concerns post Dec 2015
- □ Thoughts and next Steps



Limited scope for recovery



11/30 ncMPAs = LDMN
Only 4 recovery zones
8% of Small Isles
<3% of inshore waters
'patch' management



Small Isles MPA





Figure K4: Map of zonal measures in Sound of Canna proposed under approach 2

Using Geodatabase of Marine Festures Adjacent to Scotland (GEMS i12 - May 2014). Projection: Mercator Datum: WGS 1984 Standard Parallel: 57'N Scale 1:100,000

White cluster anemone
 Tall seapen
 Crown Copyright, 2014. All rights reserved. License No. EK001-201404001. Not to be used for Navigation.



Simple MPA management schematic



* <25m:	4 x actual depth
25-200m:	3 x actual depth
200-1000m:	2 x actual depth





South Arran MPA







Scottish Environment

Lamlash Bay No Take Zone Maerl recovery areas Proposed no bottom-towed fishing zones (Marine Scotland)

Suggested additional no bottom-towed fishing zones (LINK)

Land Ocean

Wester Ross MPA





Wester Ross pMPA Showing VMS data from 2007 to 2013








Loch Sunart to Sound of Jura MPA



Loch Sunart to Sound of Jura MPA Incorporating Loch Sunart MPA and Loch Sunart SAC Showing scallop dredge VMS density (2007 - 13)









cottis



Less dense areas



Loch Laxford SAC Showing VMS data from 2010 to 2013

-	Land	•	Trawls
	SAC boundary		Dredge
<u> </u>	ICES rectangle	0	Static





	Home	About 🗸	Why MPAs? 🗸	News-blog 🗸	Get involved	#MarineMural	Gallery	Keep informed	
F				#MP.	Awebmap				
2						6			

Don't Take the P out of MPAs -> take action here

Share: 🖸 🗗 🚷 💟 🞯 🔂

SCOTLAND'S MARINE PROTECTED AREAS ARE AT AISK OF BECOMING PAPER P Thanks for showing interest in the campaign. Our online action has just closed

11 EDno Ond Fabruar

News

Dedicated Arran conservationist wins global award... and backs real MPAs



An Ecosystem approach



"the site's overall conservation objectives will **extend beyond an isolated consideration of the Annex I habitats** and Annex II species (or relevant bird species) contained within the site and **take account of the wider ecological context of the site as a whole in terms of its effects on the designated features**"

http://www.clientearth.org/reports/natura-2000-site-integrity-briefing.pdf

83 Duties of public authorities in relation to certain decisions

- (1) This section applies where-
 - (a) a public authority has the function of determining an application (whenever made) for authorisation of the doing of any act, and
 - (b) the act is capable of affecting (other than insignificantly)—
 - (i) a protected feature in a Nature Conservation MPA,
 - (ii) a stated purpose for a Demonstration and Research MPA,
 - (iii) a marine historic asset in a Historic MPA,
 - (iv) any ecological or geomorphological process on which the conservation of any protected feature in a Nature Conservation MPA, or on which the stated purpose for a Demonstration and Research MPA, is (wholly or in part) dependent.





I II II







One Percent is Not Enough

1

where scallop dredging and bottom_set nets are banned 1:37 / 3.57

KEEP THE 'P' IN ARRAN'S MPA







Figure A3.1 – Distribution of responses



4,758 respondents

- 4,611 individuals
- 43 on behalf of groups



Inshore MPA / SAC management – Phase 1 proposed measures Proportion of sites where activities are to be prohibited

										<u> </u>					
Site		from beam trawling and suction	% protected from beam trawling and suction dredging	from mechanical	mechanical	from demersal	demersal	Protected from set nets	from set	from long				from hand	% Protected from hand gathering
East Mingulay SAC	114.89	114.89	100	114.89	100	114.89	100	57.72	50	57.72	50	57.72	2 50	0	0
Loch Creran MPA / SAC	12.26	12.26	100	12.26	100	12.26	100	12.26	100	12.26	100	7.77	63	0	0
Loch Laxford SAC	12.21	12.21	100	12.21	100	12.21	100	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Loch Sunart MPA / SAC	48.8	48.8	100	48.8	100	48.8	100	48.8	100	48.8	100	1	2	0	0
Loch Sunart to Sound of Jura MPA[1]	770.18	770.18	100	549	71	549	71	770.18	100	770.18	100	0	0	0	0
Loch Sween MPA	40.65	40.65	100	24.13	59	24.13	59	0	0	0	0	0	0	24.13	59
Lochs Duich Long and Alsh MPA / SAC	40.93	40.93	100	40.93	100	40.93	100	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Noss Head MPA	7.54	7.54	100	7.54	100	7.54	100	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Sanday SAC	109.8	109.8	100	109.8	100	109.8	100	109.8	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
Small Isles MPA	803.25	803.25	100	456.74	57	456.74	57	803.25	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
South Arran MPA	279.87	279.87	100	279.87	100	177.72	64	7.35	3	7.35	3	7.35	3	2.66	
St Kilda SAC	245.35	245.35	100	245.35	100	245.35	100	245.35	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
Treshnish Isles SAC	18.55	18.55	i 100	18.55	100	18.55	100	18.55	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
Upper Loch Fyne and Loch Goil MPA	87.65	87.65	100	87.65	100	43.1	49	7.11	8	7.11	8	7.11	8	0	0
Wester Ross MPA	599.19	599.19	100	599.19	100	360.41	60	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Wyre and Rousay Sounds MPA	16.2	16.2	100	16.2	100	16.2	100	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
TOTALS	3207.32	3207.32	100	2623.11	82	2237.63	70	2080.37	65	903.42	28	80.95	3	26.79	1
															- 74
% of Scottish Territorial Waters	3.5	3.5	5	2.9		2.5		2.3		1		0.1		0.03	
% of Scottish EEZ	0.7	0.7	r	0.6		0.5		0.5		0.2		0.02	1	0.01	
% of Scottish WFD area	6.6	6.6	Š.	5.4		4.6	1	4.3		1.9		0.17	1	0.05	

All areas are in square kilometres

All % are rounder to the nearest whole number

[1] Includes the Firth of Lorn SAC but excludes the Loch Sunart MPA / SAC.

90,404
462,263
48,710

Scottish Territorial Waters - This is measured from shore to 12nm beyond baselines





South Arran MPA





LSSoJ/SI – some trawl/dredge SA/WR – some trawling No dredge, trawl or creel



An Ecosystem approach



South Arran MPA



License No. EK001-201404001. License No. EK001-201404001. Not to be used for Navigation. Using Geodatabase of Marine Features Adjacent to Scotland (GEMS i12 - May 2014). Projection: Meroator Datum; WGS 1984 Standard Parallel: 553007 Scale 1:175,000

throughout the MPA. The 3 maeri recovery areas (identified in SNH CR749).

and the additional area identified in the September 2014 survey would prohibit all bottom contacting activities. Table A17.5 – Priority Marine Feature Added Value Assessment⁴⁶ - Protected from suction dredge, mechanical dredge, and beam trawls

Other PMFs	Feature R	ecords	Records Included	% Included	
Burrowed mud or Inshore deep mud with burrowing heart urchins	Count	4	4	100%	
Fan mussel	Count	1	1	100%	
Kelp beds	Count	8	8	100%	
Native oysters	Count	1	1	100%	

Table A17.6 – Priority Marine Feature Added Value Assessment⁴⁵ - Protected from demersal trawls

Other PMFs	Feature R	ecords	Records Included	% Included	
Burrowed mud or Inshore deep mud with burrowing heart urchins	Count	4	1	100%	
Fan mussel	Count	1	1	100%	
Kelp beds	Count	8	8	100%	
Native oysters	Count	1	1	100%	

Table A17.7 – Other Marine Habitat Added Value Assessment⁴⁶ - Protected from suction dredge, mechanical dredge, and beam trawls

Other Habitats	Feature R	ecords	Records Included	% Included	
Rocky reef communities	Count	31	31	100%	
Sandbank communities	Count	54	54	100%	
Infralittoral mixed sediment communities	Count	16	16	100%	
Circalittoral sandy mud communities	Count	39	39	100%	
Infralittoral fine mud communities	Count	1	1	100%	
Infralittoral sandy mud communities	Count	1	1	100%	
Circalittoral mixed sediment communities	Count	66	66	100%	
Infralittoral mixed sediment communities	Count	16	16	100%	

45 Using Geodatabase for Marine Habitats and Species in Scotland (GeMS 115)



Valuing the benefits: MPAs and wellbeing





Valuing the benefits of MPAs

Costs	Lower £m	Upper £m	
Commercial Fishing (Mobiles)	£1.78	£49.62	
Energy	£0.11	£2.84	
Oil and Gas	£1.20	£33.83	
Other	£0.80	£1.80	
Total Costs	£3.89	£88.09	
Benefits			
Commercial Fishing (Statics)	Not Es	timated	
Sea Angling	Not Estimated		
Other Direct and Indirect Users (Sub-Aqua, Water Sports, Wildlife Watching)	Not Es	timated	
Non User	£239	£583	
Total Benefits	>£239	>£583	

Table 3: Costs and Benefits of MPAs in Scotland

http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/S4_RuralAffairsClimateChangeandEnvironmentCom mittee/20151023_Scot_Env_LINK_letter_on_MPAs.pdf



Why we supported June announcement

□ Holistic ecosystem approach

- □ **Simple** management boundaries
- □ Proportionate **precaution**

Already some compromises (e.g. Upper Loch Fyne, South Arran, Loch Sween)



11th June 2015

"The impact in the vast majority of cases will mean modest changes to fishing patterns with very limited economic impact given the ability of vessels to fish elsewhere.

The people of Scotland want our precious marine environment safeguarded and I welcome the views of everyone who responded to the consultation."

Richard Lochhead, Environment Secretary





their anger over ne

Fishermen's leaders

Claims that Marine F

The Scottish government introduced an urgent marine conservation order to cover



- Scotland's seas in context
- □ What MPAs are for
- □ Why we supported June 2015 proposals
- □ Remaining concerns post Dec 2015
- □ Thoughts and next Steps





Loch Sunart to Sound of Jura Marine Protected Area and Firth of Lorn Special Area of Conservation (June 2015) Loch Sunart to Sound of Jura Marine Protected Area and Firth of Lorn Special Area of Conservation (December 2015)

Fisheries management measures

 Demersal trawl, dredge, set nets and lines prohibited
Set nets and lines prohibited. Mechanical dredging and demersal trawl (except beam trawl) permitted subject to conditions
Protected area

Fisheries management measures

Protected area

Demersal trawl, dredge, set nets and lines prohibited Set nets and lines prohibited. Mechanical dredging and demersal trawl (except beam trawl) permitted subject to conditions

6-205m depth

Neat, F., Pinto, C., Burrett, I., Cowie, L., Travis, J., Thorburn, J., ... & Wright, P. J. (2014). Site fidelity, survival and conservation options for the threatened flapper skate (Dipturus cf. intermedia). Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems.

Appendix E





© Crown Copyright, 2015. All rights reserved, License No. EK001-201404001. Not to be used for Navigation.

© Crown Copyright, 2015. All rights reserved. License No. EK001-201404001. Not to be used for Navigation. Projection: Lambert azimuthal equal area Datum: ETRS 1989 Scale 1:200,000 (at A4 size)

Moerella spp. with venerid bivalves in infralittoral gravelly sand *Laminaria saccharina* and red seaweeds on infralittoral sediments Reef?



Next steps

- Environment Committee consider annulments
- Spatial management for Inshore no.2 and Offshore MPAs
- MPA community co-management (e.g. Sound of Barra & South Arran)
- □ Indirect and Non-Use **Benefits** of MPAs
- □ Spatial management of fisheries outside MPAs
 - Priority Marine Feature Protection
 - Gear conflict
 - value creation (cf. Shetland)
- □ Contribution to **MSFD**?
- □ 'Sea Scotland' 15-16 June 2016, Dundee









Healthy seas benefit all



Life support Intrinsic value

Environmental services

Employment Revenue

...Planet Earth is blue and there's [something we must] do...

